



THE UNIVERSITY *of EDINBURGH*

Valuing the links between Scotland and Malawi: *Sustained growth in partnership*

This report presents a valuation of the inputs by the members of the Scotland Malawi Partnership (SMP) and estimates the number of beneficiaries as well as the people actively involved in Scotland and Malawi. It is based on a survey conducted in April 2018. The SMP commissioned this report, written by Dr Gerhard Anders of the Centre of African Studies at the University of Edinburgh, employing a version of the Social Return on Investment framework (SROI).

Summary

Scotland has a long and multi-faceted relationship with Malawi that has undergone many changes since the 19th century.¹ Today, in Scotland and Malawi there are hundreds of thousands of people who are engaged in this relationship, exchanging knowledge and ideas and working together to strengthen more than 1,000 civic links between the two countries.² Hundreds of organisations ranging from universities to small charities and community groups are involved in a multitude of projects between the two countries. Many of these projects and partnerships are funded by the Scottish and UK governments as well as other public bodies and private companies but most are funded by the communities themselves. These efforts reach a large number of beneficiaries in both Malawi and Scotland with, for example, noticeable recent improvements in access to education and health care.

Since 2004, the SMP has been instrumental in fostering the relationship between the two countries, serving as a platform for the exchange of information and helping to coordinate projects aimed at sustainable development in Malawi and intercultural dialogue. The SMP inspires people and organisations in Scotland to be involved with Malawi in an informed, coordinated and effective way. The SMP is fully committed to supporting the implementation of the UN's Sustainable Development Goals. In 2018, the SMP boasts a membership of 1,108 members including universities, faith-based organisations, local authorities, and 135 primary schools and 98 secondary schools across Scotland. Due to the diverse nature of the societal engagement and the large number of active organisations in Scotland, the SMP plays a crucial role as an umbrella organisation which facilitates the coordination of the manifold initiatives. The SMP engages the Scottish Government, the Scottish Parliament, The UK Government, the UK Parliament, as well as the Government of Malawi and the National Assembly of Malawi. In addition, the SMP works very closely with the Malawi Scotland Partnership (MaSP), the sister organisation in Malawi fully owned and led by Malawians that supports Malawi's many civil society links with Scotland.

¹ Ross, K.R. (2013) *Malawi and Scotland Together in the Talking Place since 1859*. Mzuni Press. For a general overview of the history of Malawi, see McCracken, J. (2012) *A History of Malawi, 1859-1966*. James Currey.

² Scotland Malawi Partnership and the Scottish Parliament, Malawi Cross Party Group (2016) *Scotland and Malawi: One Thousand Partnerships, every Scottish Constituency*.

In April 2018, the SMP conducted a survey of their members and valued the inputs made by the members of the SMP using a methodology based on the established framework of ‘Social Return on Investment’. The results of this valuation were compared with two surveys and valuations of SMP members made in 2010 and 2014.³ The present study employed a comparable methodology to that used in 2010 and 2014, allowing analysis of general trends between 2010 and 2018. The members who participated in these surveys were asked to place a value on their activities over the previous twelve months, including formal budget, in-kind donations and volunteer time. Members were also asked to estimate the number of persons who benefited from their activities in Malawi and Scotland, as well as the number actively involved in their work. The results of the survey were used to establish an aggregate value of these activities and the numbers of people who benefited and were involved.

The analysis shows that the value of inputs made by members of the SMP to Scotland’s links with Malawi is estimated over £49 million between April 2017 and end of March 2018. Additionally, the responses from members indicate that an estimated 2.9 million Malawians have benefited directly from these activities in 2017-18. For instance, Mary’s Meals feeds 937,997 Malawian school children per day. This is 30% of primary school aged children across the country. More than 208,000 Malawians and 109,000 people in Scotland have been actively involved in delivering these partnerships.

These numbers highlight the growth and strength of the links between Scotland and Malawi. Since 2014 total inputs have grown by 24% and the number of direct beneficiaries in Malawi has grown by 45% reflecting the growth of 692 members in 2014 to 1,108 members in 2018.

Background

The SMP came out of Strathclyde University’s ‘Malawi Millennium Project’ in early 2004, in response to the belief that there was a need to bring together under a single umbrella the many organisations and individuals throughout Scotland engaged in fostering and developing links between Scotland and Malawi. With the support of the Lord Provosts of Glasgow and Edinburgh, the Scotland Malawi Partnership was officially launched in April 2004. The SMP acts as an umbrella organisation that exists to inspire the people and organisations of Scotland to be involved with Malawi in an informed, coordinated and effective way for the benefit of people in both countries. It is non-governmental, independent and non-partisan. The SMP fosters mutually beneficial links between Scotland and Malawi and encourages the development of sustainable projects in Malawi. It works closely with (and is funded by) the Scottish Government through its Malawi Development Programme, and facilitates the Cross Party Group on Malawi in the Scottish Parliament and now also the All-Party Parliamentary Group on Malawi in the UK Parliament.

Since its creation, the SMP has grown significantly, reflecting the broad and thriving engagement of Scottish civil society in a wide range of relationships with Malawian partners. Between 2010 and 2014, the SMP grew by 53%, from 450 members to 692 members in 2014 representing all strata of Scottish society ranging from schools and universities to half of Scotland’s local councils and many non-governmental organisations and charities. Since 2014, the SMP has expanded its membership in all categories across Scotland. In 2018, the SMP had 1,108 members (a growth of 60% since 2014).

³ Anders, G. (2014) *The value of Scotland’s links with Malawi: Building on the past, shaping the future* (available at: http://www.scotland-malawipartnership.org/files/4814/3585/6895/University_of_Edinburgh_2014_Scotland-Malawi_paper.pdf). Dritsas, L. (2010) *Valuing Scotland’s links with Malawi: inputs from Scotland Malawi Partnership Members*.

The strong and rapid growth in membership from 450 members in 2010 to 1,108 members in 2018 (an increase of 146% in less than 10 years) highlights the enthusiasm for developing the connections with Malawi in Scotland.

In 2018, SMP membership consisted of 84 large organisations (with a turnover exceeding £80,000), 33 medium organisations (turnover between £20,000 and £80,000), 65 small organisations (turnover under £20,000), 282 individual members, 17 Scottish local authorities, 135 primary schools, 98 secondary schools and 394 youth members. Compared with 2014 membership in all categories has grown significantly.⁴ Particularly impressive was the growth of youth members from 176 members in 2014 to 394 members in 2018 (123%) bearing testimony to the strength of the ties between young people in Scotland and Malawi.

The civil society activities of the SMP and its members complement the Scottish Government's Malawi Development Programme and the programmes funded by the Department for International Development (DfID), the largest donor agency in Malawi with a budget of £80 million in 2017/18.

Project Rationale

As an umbrella organisation representing the manifold connections between Scotland and Malawi, it is important the Scotland Malawi Partnership (SMP) can articulate the scale, breadth and diversity of all the many and varied civil society links between Scotland and Malawi; communicate the overall impact of all these different links and partnerships; and demonstrate the incredible *value* of this unique national effort. In order to advance these priorities, the SMP commissioned the University of Edinburgh to undertake a valuation of Scotland-Malawi activity in terms of the relative total financial value of civil society inputs to Scotland's links with Malawi as well as the number of beneficiaries and people involved in both Malawi and Scotland, using a methodology based on the established concept of 'Social Return on Investment'. The SMP commissioned Dr Gerhard Anders of the Centre of African Studies at the University of Edinburgh to write this report using the data generated by the survey conducted in April 2018.

The Social Return on Investment Framework

In response to the challenge of placing a financial value on all the activities of 'third sector' organisations (i.e., charities, volunteer organisations and social enterprises), the Social Return on Investment (SROI) framework was developed in part by the Roberts Enterprise Development Fund⁵. It has now become a common tool in the UK for helping third sector organisations describe how they are creating change through their activities. The SROI framework enables organisations to place a value on all the inputs that their activities require and the social, environmental and economic benefits resulting from their activities. With these valuations, they are then able to tell a story that demonstrates the 'return' made on investments (public or private) to them. It is important to stress that the narratives produced by a SROI analysis provide an expression of value, not money: 'Money is simply a common unit and as such is a useful and widely accepted way of conveying value'.⁶

⁴ Anders, G. (2014) *The value of Scotland's links with Malawi: Building on the past, shaping the future* (available at: http://www.scotland-malawipartnership.org/files/4814/3585/6895/University_of_Edinburgh_2014_Scotland-Malawi_paper.pdf).

⁵ Lawlor, E. et al. (2008) *Measuring Value: a guide to Social Return on Investment (SROI)*, 2nd edition, New Economics Foundation, London.

⁶ Nicholls, J. et al. (2009) *A Guide to Social Return on Investment*. Cabinet Office, London. (available from the SROI Network <http://www.sroi-uk.org/>).

Methodology

A full SROI report will usually include a discussion of both inputs to an organisation's activities and the outputs or impacts made by the organisation. It will also attempt to tell a 'story' or 'theory of change' about how the organisation makes a difference in the world. The present study is not a complete SROI analysis in this regard for two reasons. First, in this study we are only identifying and valuing the inputs, or investments, required to make the activities of the member organisations possible. Second, this study assesses the activities of the SMP's members, *not* the SMP itself. Therefore, the results represent an aggregation of, and extrapolation from, the responses of the members about the value of the inputs required for their activities to occur. The identification and valuation of inputs is the crucial first step of any SROI analysis. As an analysis of inputs, this study was conducted according to the principles of SROI: involving stakeholders, understanding what changes, valuing things that matter, only including what is material, not over-claiming, being transparent and verifying the result.⁷

Data Organisation

The study proceeded with a review of the membership database numbering 1,108 members, organising it into five main categories: full members (organisations), associate members (individuals), local authorities, school partnerships and youth members. Each category was then further divided into working subcategories based upon the type of work an organisation or individual was involved in and its size in terms of budget and number of projects. The subcategories were not used for strict analytical purposes, but rather to ensure that responses to the survey covered a representative cross-section of the membership and to increase the accuracy of the subsequent process of extrapolation:

- Full members were disaggregated by scale:
 1. 'Large' organisations were categorised as those with an annual turnover exceeding £80,000, including, for example, the University of Glasgow, Mary's Meals and 500 Miles (84 members fell in this category).
 2. 'Medium' organisations were categorised as those with an annual turnover between £20,000 and £80,000, including, for example, the Chesney Trust (for education in Malawi) and Global Concerns Trust (33 members fell in this category).
 3. 'Small' organisations were categorised as those with an annual turnover below £20,000, including, for example, Jubilee Scotland, Kenyawi Kids and the Ayr Presbytery Malawi Initiative (65 members fell in this category).
- Individual associate members in the fields of agriculture, business, communities, education, fundraising, governance, health, religion and general (282 members fell in this category).
- Scottish local authorities across Scotland including Glasgow City Council, East Lothian Council, South Ayrshire Council and Perth and Kinross Council (17 members were in this category, representing more than half of Scotland's 32 local authorities).
- School partnerships were divided according to primary or secondary schools across Scotland including schools in Ayrshire, Glasgow, Strathclyde, the Lothians, Edinburgh, Fife, Dundee, the Cairngorms, Argyll and Bute, Inverness, the Outer Hebrides and the Orkney Islands (this category comprised 135 primary schools and 98 secondary schools in Scotland).

⁷ Nicholls, J. et al. (2009): 96 – 98.

- Youth members constituted a separate category, consisting of initiatives by young Scots who want to make a difference in Malawi and foster intercultural dialogue with their peers in Malawi (394 members were in this category).

Defining Inputs

In any SROI analysis many assumptions have to be made about the value of non-monetised items that are material to the delivery of an organisation's activity. Items such as volunteer time and travel, in-kind donations of meeting spaces or donations of physical goods must be given a value to be included in the analysis. It was also considered important to query how many persons benefited from or were involved in the activities; this information helped to contextualise the valuation of inputs. With the databases organised, a standard set of inputs to be measured was developed so that members could easily provide a quick response. These were:

1. The value of all the inputs required for an organisation's activities to occur inclusive of monetised and non-monetised inputs, including:
 - Any formal costs or budgets (e.g. donations, grant income, subscriptions, entrance fees to events, personal expenses, etc.)
 - The total value of all in-kind donations (e.g. transport, food, material goods, etc.)
 - An estimate of the total value of volunteer time.
2. The number of beneficiaries of an organisation's work, both in Malawi and in Scotland (note: it is standard in SROI procedures to not value the time spent by beneficiaries during their involvement with an activity).
3. The number of persons actively involved in running the project, both in Malawi and in Scotland (note: the value of time contributed by those 'actively involved' was incorporated under 1, but it was felt that knowing the number of persons involved would be informative).

The Survey

With the inputs defined, the survey questions were written and guidance provided to help the membership to respond. In April 2018, all SMP members were sent the survey by email and asked to respond. Members were instructed, 'Precise figures are not required, rather we ask you to think laterally about all the in-kind support which underpins your work with Malawi'. 61 members responded (sample size of 5.5% of the total membership of 1,108).⁸

The survey consisted of three questions:

1. In Pounds Sterling, how much are all the inputs to your Malawi-links worth, over the last 12 months?
2. How many people over the last year have engaged with, and how many have directly and indirectly benefited from, your work in Malawi?
3. How many people have been actively involved in your Malawi projects over the last 12 months?

⁸ The target was 5%.

Analysis

All responses were collected and recorded on a spreadsheet to calculate average figures for each of the membership sub-categories. In order to facilitate a fair, representative and conservative extrapolation process, obvious outliers (organisations operating at a disproportionate scale or impact such as Mary's Meals and the Church of Scotland) were removed from the subcategory average and only re-added in the final aggregation as standalone figures. The guiding principle of this exercise was to be conservative in all estimates and ensure the exclusion of any cases of double-counting.

Results

In total 61 responses were received. From this data, the following results are reported:

- The value of inputs of money, time and in-kind donations made by the membership of the SMP to Scotland's links with Malawi was approximately £49 million between April 2017 and end of March 2018. Compared to the 2014 findings, this is an increase of 24%, reflecting the growth of the SMP's membership from 692 in 2014 to 1,108 in 2018.
- It is estimated that 2.9 million Malawians have benefited from these activities over the same period. Compared to 2014 this is an increase of 45%. It should also be noted that a large number of people in Malawi and Scotland benefited indirectly from the input of SMP members. Based on the available data it can be assumed that more than 5.6 million Malawians and approximately 262,000 Scots benefited indirectly from inputs by SMP members.
- Approximately 208,000 Malawians and 109,000 people in Scotland were actively involved in delivering these activities. Compared to 2014, this is an increase of 5% and 16% respectively.

The growth of SMP membership and the increase in the value of inputs, as well as the growing numbers of beneficiaries and people actively involved between April 2017 and March 2018, bear testimony to the very strong interest in Malawi existing in all strata of the Scottish population. It shows the efficacy of the SMP to act as a platform and conduit for Scottish civil society initiatives aimed at assisting Malawians in realizing development and fighting poverty.

Case Studies

From the SMP membership of 1,108 organisations and key individuals, four case studies exemplify the scope, diversity and quality of the activities of SMP members:

- Mary's Meals is one of the largest members of the SMP. The organisation provides school meals to children in several African and Asian countries including Malawi with the objective to attract hungry children to school to gain a better future for themselves and their families. In Malawi, Mary's Meals feeds 937,997 children across 782 schools and 58 under-six centres each day they go to school and has had a significant impact on improving school enrolment rates, performance and access to education.
- 17 of Scotland's 32 local authorities are members of the Scotland Malawi Partnership. One of the most active members in this category is Glasgow City Council where the Lord Provost has a special Malawi Fund which supports a variety of health, education and water and sanitation projects in Malawi. Recent projects include providing IT equipment and training to teachers, the construction of a HIV/AIDS clinic at Chikwawa District Hospital, and a Prosthetics and Orthotics clinic at Kamuzu Central Hospital. Between 2004-2017, Glasgow City Council

shipped 5,477 items of medical equipment, 10,545 boxes of medical supplies and 2784 desktop and 193 laptop computers to Malawi.

- The Chesney Trust has been established to provide educational opportunities for girls in northern Malawi by building a secondary boarding school at Engcongolweni, and by funding of bursaries for poorer students. At present, the school has a roll of 157 pupils in Forms 1 to 4, which the Chesney Trust plans to increase to 320. Community projects undertaken include the construction of a bridge to improve access for local people. In Scotland, more than 1,200 and in Malawi almost 400 people are actively involved in the partnership. In Malawi, 1,200 people benefited from the partnership in 2017/18.
- The Linthipe-Auchterarder School Partnership established in 2007 has resulted in two-way teacher exchange, tree and vegetable planting, laptop and projector training, digital microscopes and solar suns for science projects and to help study at night and, Global citizenship awareness resulting in building a Science Lab and toilets at Mkhanza Primary School. In June 2018, 15 Scottish pupils will spend a week with their Malawian link pupils living near the school. Each day they will cycle to Linthipe Secondary School to take classes and engage in a range of activities to develop practical and leadership skills and discuss cultural differences. The bicycles bought in Malawi will be left in Linthipe.

Discussion

In general, careful thought was put into the estimates made by the members. This provided confidence in the analysis stage, as the responses were used to extrapolate to the wider membership. The SMP and members themselves were cautious to avoid over-reporting and double-counting. Information from the SMP's complete membership database⁹, combined with the SMP's detailed knowledge of its membership, was used to identify outliers (most notably, Mary's Meals and the University of Strathclyde) whose scale of operation was disproportionate and unrepresentative of other members in that subcategory. These outliers were removed from the process of averaging within each subcategory, so as to not skew or exaggerate the extrapolated figures. Outlier data was only included in the final aggregated figures, as a standalone number, rather than included in the extrapolation. Where such adjustments were required, in most cases the typical values were adjusted downwards given the principle of being conservative in all estimates and assumptions.

Where an organisation was not able to provide inputs due to the scale of their work (for example the Church of Scotland), this data was excluded from the extrapolation. Where the SMP feared double counting (for example, in the work of local authorities), or where estimates appeared to be excessively large, this data too was excluded. Where a specific membership category had a sample size under the target 5% additional median data was included from the 2014 survey to ensure a representative sample.

A great strength of the SMP model is the fact that it does not look to create or control civic links with Malawi but rather coordinates, represents and supports activity which is locally owned and locally led. This 'bottom-up' approach has helped support sustained growth over many years. A challenge of this model, however, is that it is difficult to precise total figures on the national effort. This study has made every effort to calculate the likely scale and impact of SMP members' work but is important to note that these are estimate figures rather than precise values.

⁹ Available online at: www.scotland-malawipartnership.org/members.html

Outlook

The value of all inputs in just one year, approximately £49 million, highlights the scale of the relationship and the goodwill invested in the links between Scotland and Malawi. It is an impressive figure and, in conjunction with the findings that an estimated 2.9 million Malawians directly benefited from the activities of SMP members and more than 109,000 people in Scotland were involved in them, demonstrates that the links between Scotland and Malawi are extremely valuable to both countries.

The increase in the value of inputs, beneficiaries in Malawi, and people actively involved in Scotland and Malawi, indicates that this commitment to development in Malawi has further strengthened since 2014, when the last survey was conducted, and is bound to grow with the continued support of the Scottish, UK and Malawian governments.

Together with her sister organisation, the Malawi Scotland Partnership, the Scotland Malawi Partnership will continue to play a crucial role in developing the links between the two countries engaging a wide range of audiences including the Malawian diaspora in Scotland. The Scotland Malawi Partnership's contribution will be key in raising awareness in Scotland and beyond, supporting business, trade and investment in Malawi, and fostering the civic links between universities, schools, local councils and individual members.



Gerhard Anders, PhD, LLM

23 April 2018

Dr Gerhard Anders is a Lecturer in African Studies and International Development at the School of Social and Political Science, University of Edinburgh. He has conducted extensive research on the implementation of good governance policies and public services in sub-Saharan Africa. He is the author of numerous publications on international development, legal anthropology, international criminal justice and transitional justice including *In the Shadow of Good Governance: An Ethnography of Civil Service Reform in Africa* (2010) on everyday experiences of government employees in the context of civil service reform implemented in Malawi. He regularly provides expert advice to the Department for International Development and the Government of Malawi.